

**Mobility and Access Committee for Scotland (MACS)
Main Committee meeting**

**Minutes of meeting held on Tuesday 23 July 2019
Conference Room 2, Victoria Quay Edinburgh**

Present:

Naghat Ahmed
Linda Bamford, Convener
Joanne Fairweather
Sheila Fletcher
Susan Fulton
David Hunter
Hussein Patwa
Keith Robertson
Fraser Sutherland
Michael Tornow

Secretariat:

Karen Armstrong – Deputy Sponsor (for Agenda Item 4)
Douglas Adams - Secretary
Aga Lysak – Secretary

In attendance:

Guest speakers:
Stuart McNeil - Traveline Scotland
Paul White – Confederation of Passenger Transport (CPT)

Observers:
Rachael Murphy - Community Transport Association (CTA)
Emer Murphy - Community Transport Association (CTA)
Steven Russell - Stagecoach

Apologies:

Audrey Birt
Marsali Craig
Hilary Stubbs
John Whitfield

Agenda Item 1 - Welcome and Apologies

- 1.1 The Convener welcomed all attendees and noted apologies as listed above. She invited all around the table to introduce themselves for voice orientation purposes.
- 1.2 She asked the Committee to note that George Mowat Brown had resigned from MACS and extended her thanks to George for his time with the committee, wishing him well for the future.

Agenda Item 2 - Minutes of the previous meeting, matters arising and action points

2.1 The minutes of the previous meeting of 23 April 2019 had been previously agreed electronically. However the following errors were identified and asked to be rectified:

2.1a. Para 3.13 it should read “Integrated Joint Boards” and not Integrated Joint Health Boards”.

2.1b Para 3.7 - should read “that there is an issue with how the term accessibility is interpreted”.

2.2 On the previous action point 10 from the January 2019 meeting, in Para 2.2.3, Linda explained that the meeting with Laura Murdoch and the Bus team had been rescheduled and was going to take place after this MACS meeting.

2.2 The Convener reiterated that there is an urgent need to clarify the term of “accessibility” and asked the Accessibility Team to seek assistance of the Accessible Transport Steering Group with defining this term and how it should be interpreted.

<p>Action Point 1: Karen Armstrong to work with TS Steering Group to assist with defining the term “accessibility” and how it should be interpreted.</p>

2.3 Susan attended the first event on the Place Standard Tool, organised by NHS Health Scotland and it was agreed that it would be beneficial for MACS to continue to engage on this issue.

2.4 It was agreed that all action points had been completed. The following comments were made:

2.4a On Action Point 5, which requested Sheila to contact Lothian Buses to request the company's policy on the carriage of mobility scooters, Sheila confirmed that due to company's staff being on strike she has not heard anything and will share any information as soon as she receives it. It was pointed out that some other big bus operators allow passengers to try out if their mobility scooters fit the ramp/lift.

2.4b On Action Point 7, David thanked Hussein for clarification on how decisions around the Access for All Station improvement programme are made and stated that it would be beneficial for MACS to hear further updates on which Scottish stations can benefit from the funding.

Action Point 2: Hussein Patwa to provide an update on which Scottish stations can benefit from Access for All funding.

Agenda Item 3 – Convener's update

3.1 The Convener reiterated that MACS' work is being recognised and valued at ministerial level across many portfolios, not only transport related. The three ministerial engagement in this reporting period were with:

- Cabinet Secretary for Culture, Tourism and External Affairs, Fiona Hyslop
- Cabinet Secretary for Social Security and Older People, Shirley-Ann Somerville
- Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands, Paul Wheelhouse MSP

The letters received from Ms Hyslop and Ms Somerville (both circulated to members) not only thanked MACS for its work and recommendations but also indicated the increase in awareness of the important of accessible transport and recognition that transport is essential in every aspect of people's lives.

3.2 Following the receipt of the letter from Ms Hyslop, the Convener wrote to the CEO of Visit Scotland, Mr Malcolm Roughead OBE, asking for the possibility of sharing data on accessible tourism in Scotland to help with MACS work as well as seeking any potential for VisitScotland to carry out research, good or bad, on tourist's experience of travel and the ease of connections between modes and destinations.

She also invited Mr Roughead to the next Development Day on 29 August 2019 devoted to Airports and Special Assistance.

3.3 Linda confirmed that the second level of engagement with Motability (as a follow up to the roundtable MACS facilitated in March 2019) has already started. MACS is connecting with stakeholders before the next roundtable discussion takes place on 5 November.

The Motability Subgroup Group (Linda, David, Hilary and Fraser) will share any papers with the wider committee at a later stage.

3.4 Linda confirmed that a team building exercise/opportunity will take place on 11 September 2019 and it is aimed at enabling members to learn about each other traits to improve communications and the level of collaborative working within the Committee.

She also confirmed that the Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity, Michael Matheson, will attend the session to introduce himself to the whole committee and discuss any arising issues. This will probably take the form of a 45 minute open discussion.

3.5 Linda proposed that the Committee needed to focus more on transport to health and social care, including identifying the current issues and barriers for disabled people when accessing health care provision.

3.5a She recommended that in order to advise the ministers adequately, MACS should set up a short-life subgroup comprising of herself, Sheila Fletcher, Audrey Birt, Susan Fulton, Fraser Sutherland and Michael Tornow to engage with a variety of stakeholders and gather evidence to identify the barriers and offer potential solutions.

3.5b Linda suggested that the subgroup group should meet by the end of August and create agenda and papers for the roundtable discussion with stakeholders to be held by December 2019. A report should then be produced with Secretariat assistance and ministerial meetings should take place at the beginning of 2020 to provide advice to ministers within the health, transport and equalities portfolios. Committee agreed to this proposal albeit they understood the enormity of the project.

3.6 Linda confirmed that MACS has already started gathering and assessing information on transport to health and detailed the current on-going actions:

3.6.1 Marsali and John will attend a meeting of the Grampian Health and Transport Action Plan to network and discuss issues. This is themed around “can everyone travel with confidence”.

3.6.2 Sheila and Linda will be meeting with Badenoch and Strathspey Access Panel (BaSAP) to discuss their work on transport to health and the findings.

3.6.3 Audrey is scoping comments on transport to health submitted via the “Care Opinion”.

3.6.4 Audrey and Fraser are attending the Scottish Ambulance Service consultation event on Patient Transport Service (PTS) vehicle design.

3.6.5 Susan is examining into Local Outcomes Improvement Plans and Community Planning Partnerships remits to look for a potential route for MACS to commence dialogue.

3.6.6 The Poverty and Inequality Commission has produced a report¹ around transport poverty with 13 recommendations, linking to a human rights based approach and some of the recommendations citing the needs of disabled people, people living in rural areas and difficulties with transport when accessing healthcare. Since Linda was appointed as a Poverty and Inequality Commissioner, she will act as a link between two bodies.

3.6.7 Marsali continues to link with the EHRC around their priority Aim 2 of their strategy on transport².

3.6.8 Michael will audit and collate information from 14 NHS Territorial Board websites focusing purely on general availability of public transport and comment on the following:

- Is there any information at all about how to get to/from the hospital by public transport?
- Does the information simply amount to a link to travel line?
- If there is information provided is this simply a map with no text alternative description?
- If there is information about how to get to/from the hospital site does this include any information about how accessible the public transport is for people with disabilities?
- Is there any information on how to recover costs for people on low or restricted incomes to ensure journeys are affordable?

¹ <https://povertyinequality.scot/wp-content/uploads/2019/06/Transport-and-Poverty-in-Scotland-Report-of-the-Poverty-and-Inequality-Commission.pdf>

² <https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/en/what-we-do/our-strategic-plan>

3.6.9 Linda will link the scoping work to other statutory bodies work and recommendations as well as the 5 ambitions of a Fairer Scotland and she welcomed David's idea to contact Audit Scotland and request data.

3.6.10 David will approach Audit Scotland with the ask that they conduct a further audit on Transport for Health and Social Care as a follow up to the last report produced in 2011.³

Action Point 3: David to contact Audit Scotland and request that they conduct a further audit on Transport for Health and Social Care as a follow up to the last report produced in 2011.

3.6.11 Sheila will collate any outstanding reports on integrated transport to health and social care initiatives for review to gauge any progress of identify good practice initiatives.

3.6.12 Aga to contact Sam Richie, Head of Patient Transport Service at Scottish Ambulance Service (SAS) and invite her along to a MACS meeting in October, when transport to health subgroup will present an escalation paper on the issue.

Action Point 4: Aga to invite Sam Richie, Head of Patient Transport Service at Scottish Ambulance Service (SAS) to the MACS October meeting.

3.7 Linda also proposed to devote the March 2020 Development Day to transport to health and invite the Equality Human Rights Commission to talk about their progress with Strategic Goal 1 Priority Aim 2 – “Public transport supports the economic and social inclusion of disabled people and older people”. She then went on to confirm that MACS is continuously pushing for meaningful and consistent EQIAs, which has the support of Ms McKelvie, the Minister for Older People and Equalities. Linda suggested that a follow up meeting with Ms McKelvie should be scheduled for Autumn, to follow up on the progress of EQIAs.

Action Point 5: MACS to request a meeting with Ms McKelvie, the Minister for Older People and Equalities.

3.8 Linda confirmed that preparations for the Development Day, which is taking place on 29 August 2019 are well underway. The event is being co-facilitated by Hilary Stubbs and Claire Smith and is themed around Aviation and Special Assistance.

³ https://www.audit-scotland.gov.uk/docs/health/2011/nr_110804_transport_health.pdf

3.9 Linda confirmed that the first ever 4 Nations meeting, facilitated by MACS, is taking place on 8 August in Edinburgh and the feedback received so far suggests that officials and MACS counterparts from other administrations are very enthusiastic and eager to work together.

3.10 Linda noted that the new format of the workstreams' reports creates lots of repetition as workstreams' work often overlaps and leads end up reporting the same issues. She then suggested that only one combined report should be created, based on contributions from members feeding to their leads and then leads feeding into the final version created by the convener, who would finalise the report from a strategic point of view. This new approach would allow more detailed discussion on arising issues and help with evidence gathering for the next Annual Report. Members agreed to this.

3.11 Linda alluded to the letter received from Mr Matheson thanking MACS for the Annual Report. In his letter the Cabinet Secretary advised that he had proposed to resist amendment 258 of the Transport (Scotland) Bill requiring Ministers to publish a report, setting out the steps they have taken to make information on public transport services accessible, on the basis that Ministers are already advised by MACS. He invited the committee to consider undertaking appropriate actions, which might involve including it as part of the next work programme. This was due to be submitted to Ministers by 31 March 2020. The prominence of MACS within Government has clearly increased and with this has created a greater responsibility for MACS to provide high-quality and timely advice, in line with its work programme.

3.12 It was agreed that the Planning and Strategy Workstream would discuss how best to respond to this ask and feed back to the full committee.

Agenda Item 4 - Sponsor Team update

4.1 Karen Armstrong gave an overview on the work currently being undertaken by the Sponsor Team:

4.1.1 Budget - half of the MACS budget has been spent and she asked members to submit their expenses regularly and as soon after the costs were incurred to allow more effective planning of resources.

4.1.2 Blue Badge – the Accessibility Team is working on the advice for Scottish Ministers on how to react to the extension of the English

eligibility criteria, taking effect on 30 August 2019. Having analysed the gathered intelligence, officials are going to recommend to “wait and see” what effect the extension is going to have in England. There are currently no calls for further extensions to the Scottish scheme, as the Scottish eligibility criteria already cater for people with hidden disabilities, who pose a risk to themselves or others in traffic.

4.1.2a Comments provided by members confirm that the new digital system works extremely well for people who are eligible automatically, however improvement on the application process is still required for those who require further assessment. MACS welcomed this development and confirmed their support of streamlining the reapplication process and ensuring that applicants are not asked repetitively for information already held by their local authority.

4.1.2b Karen confirmed that the Blue Badge team is going to assess the effectiveness of the assessment process across Scotland and then work with all local authorities to ensure that the process is smooth and user friendly consistently across the country.

4.1.3 Annual Delivery Plan – the team is working closely with partners on the implementation of the plan (i.e. communication with transport operators has started on hate crime charter, SEStran launched a new branding of the Thistle Assistance) and a progress report for each priority is being produced.

4.1.4 The Accessible Travel Internal Working Group is being revitalised by Karen to ensure a more collaborative and effective output.

4.1.5 Ministerial engagement – during summer recess Mr Matheson will be undertaking three tours (one on bus and two on accessibility) to promote public transport and improvements to make it inclusive for all.

4.1.6 Inclusive transport strategy – Karen is contributing to the UK consultation on autonomous vehicles and their sustainability, in terms of legislation and accessibility. Sheila and Keith confirmed that they are already engaging with Transport Scotland Low Carbon Vehicle Team on the issue and agreed to work jointly with Karen on it. Keith noted that the review on the recharging points was necessary to ensure their accessibility and agreed to pursue this.

4.1.7 Staffing – Karl Zaczek moved on to the Ports, Shipping, Freight and Canals Team within Transport Scotland and the recruitment process is already taking place to fill in the vacancy.

4.2 David expressed his disappointment on the discontinuity of Accessible Transport element of the Active Travel Funding, especially in light of £80 million budget. It was confirmed that the Active Travel budget was not being reduced but the funds available for active travel initiatives through the accessible travel work had ceased.

4.3 Brexit – in light of the uncertainty of the negotiations and the prospect of a no-deal scenario, there is a possibility that staff and resources within Transport Scotland might be reshuffled at a short notice.

4.4 Patrick Nyamurundira, the TS Rail Accessibility Manager, is returning to ScotRail and his position in Transport Scotland is going to be filled in soon.

4.5 In response to the Sponsor Team update Linda made the following asks:

4.5.1 Page 2 point 4.2 on Go Upstream – Could the survey results be made available to MACS and what were the identified improvements to make moving between different transport modes as easy as possible for everyone?

Action Point 6: Karen Armstrong to obtain and share with MACS the Go Upstream survey result.

4.5.2 Page 8 – Rail Passenger Assist – What are/ who are Equality Advisory Panels?

Action Point 7: Secretariat to contact the TS Rail Team and find out what and who Equality Advisory Panels are.

4.5.3 Page 9 point 33 – Accessible Travel Annual Delivery Plan 2019/20 – Linda offered MACS assistance in reviewing progress on the eight priority areas around December 2019-Feb 2020, which Karen welcomed. It was confirmed that the annual reviews of the delivery plan would be tasked to MACS Planning and Strategy Workstream and that David Hunter (Workstream Lead) would lead on this for MACS. The workstream would plan to conduct this initial review between December 2019 and February 2020.

Action Plan 8: Planning and Strategy Workstream to review the Accessible Travel Annual Delivery Plan 2019/2020 between December 2019 and February 2020.

Agenda Item 5 - Guest speakers – Stuart McNeil - Travel Line Scotland & Paul White – Confederation of Passenger Transport (CPT)

5.1 Convener confirmed that Q & A session was going to be held after the presentations and asked members to hold off with any questions until that time.

5.2 Stuart thanked the Convener for the invitation. He provided a brief overview of what Traveline is and scope for a joined work at the upcoming projects.

- He confirmed that Traveline is Scotland's national public transport information service, established in 2000.
- It operates 24/7 and deals with a huge volume of enquiries (with a target of answering a call within 30 seconds).
- The company's website⁴ (1.5 million viewers a month), mobile apps or call centre (3,500 calls a week) provide information on how to plan a start-to-end journey using public transport and provide timetables for all modes of transport.
- The core element of the company's work is to gather data for all modes of transport, with buses being the most difficult to manage, due to the multiple providers on around 2000 routes.
- Information is provided in partnership with Transport Scotland, local authorities and transport operators to ensure the data is accurate, up-to-date and consistent.
- Financial contributions are made by Transport Scotland and Transport Operators with local authorities being the main data supplier and maintainer of the bus stops.
- Journey planning facility is different from providing timetables – it outlines all steps required to undertake the journey and allows users to add preferences and mixture of modes of transport, taking into account information on road disruption and closures and suggesting alternative routes.
- Compiling information on ticket fares is challenging as currently data provided by operators is not consistent. It is anticipated that the requirements on operators to provide more structured information in the upcoming Transport (Scotland) Bill will help and enable to advise passengers of the better deals for their journey.
- Their call centre staff are trained to answer a variety of queries on behalf on different transport operators. Agents, who work on shifts,

⁴ <https://www.travelinescotland.com/>

are also able to sign post callers adequately to ensure their needs are met (e.g. they made travellers aware of the Thistle Assistance Tool).

- Traveline website is WCAG 2.1 AA standard, which is reviewed regularly and any identified areas for improvement are dealt with to keep up with accessibility standards.
- Work is currently ongoing to gather information on the accessibility of vehicles and infrastructure, however this is a challenging project as local authorities' resources are stretched and they either do not have relevant data or the data available is not consistent in quality, quantity and structure. Therefore Traveline would be very much interested in working with MACS as the committee might be in a position to help gather the required information. MACS' advice would also be beneficial on contract specifications to ensure accessibility is taken into account and on bus accessibility information gathering.

5.3 Paul confirmed that although he had been with CPT for the last 10 years he is new to the Director role. He also gave a brief overview of his company:

- Confederation of Passenger Transport (CPT) is a recognised voice for coach and bus industry. Not all UK operators are members of CPT, however majority (95%) are.
- Buses are the most important mode of transport as around 75% of people using public transport use buses. Buses serve many purposes and show their importance in enabling people to travel for work and leisure, have a huge impact in tackling social isolation, and connect people across the country. Buses help with traffic congestion and improve air quality.
- There are four main pieces of legislation applying to buses:
 - ✓ Public Service Vehicle Accessibility Regulations 2000 (PSVAR)
 - ✓ Disability Discrimination Act 1995
 - ✓ Drivers Certificate of Professional Competence
 - ✓ Driver Accessibility Training – still awaiting DfT Best Practice Guidance, which extends to all staff, not just drivers.
- Since the legislation is mainly a reserved matter, CPT is working with Department for Transport on progress on any changes depend on DfT's timescale (i.e. audible and visible announcements on buses, Inclusive Mobility Guidance, Inclusive Transport Accreditation Scheme).

5.4 Paul confirmed that he was impressed with the MACS Annual Report, which he had circulated among CPT members, and offered to forward any feedback from members to MACS.

Action Point 9: Paul White to forward CPT's members' feedback on MACS Annual Report.

5.5 During the Q&A session the following points were discussed:

5.5.1 Sheila made a point that it is extremely difficult to advise on vehicles accessibility, given that the terminology of "accessibility" has not yet been defined and it is interpreted inconsistently across the industry.

Also she pointed out that many buses or coaches are deemed as accessible and compliant with PSVAR, however, since the legislation is outdated, often vehicles with steps, which are not suitable for people with mobility impairments, are labelled as accessible. The lack of a consistent and standardised definition of vehicle accessibility makes it impossible for many passengers to make informed decisions or undertake their journey.

5.5.2 Paul recalled recent successful changes in Fife, resulted from the feedback MACS had provided to Stagecoach. He acknowledged that there is a need for tightening up the "accessibility" definition, especially when MACS believes vehicles that comply with current guidelines are not properly accessible. He was also supportive of MACS' call for an immediate review of the definition when liaising with DfT. He also agreed that a review of the Public Service Vehicle Access Regulations (PSVAR) earlier than 2027 would be beneficial, however he pointed out that any timescale for implementation needs to be realistic so operators don't find themselves in a position that their fleet becomes non-compliant mid-life."

5.5.3 To ensure that patients can use public transport to attend their healthcare appointments, Traveline is currently working with NHS 24 to encourage usage of search engines to help identify the best travel option available. MACS welcomed this development and stated their interest in this work area as part of their Transport to Health project.

5.5.4 In order to provide information on roadworks and disruption, Traveline liaises closely with operators and not the Roadworks Commissioner to ensure that the most accurate and up-to-date information is provided.

5.5.5 Keith pointed out that the Disability Discrimination Act 1995 (DDA) is superseded by the Equality Act 2010, which is more recent.

MACS asked Paul if he could advocate that CPT members stopped referring to DDA and refer to the Equality Act 2010 instead.

Action Point 10: Paul White to advocate that CPT members refer to Equality Act 2010 rather than DDA 1995.

5.5.5 Hussein asked for a revision of the accessibility for the Traveline application for Android, which is currently not helpful for people with visual impairment.

5.5.6 Currently the journey planner does not include a facility for planning an accessible journey and there is not enough data to provide such information. Hussain pointed out that staff should also be trained to make them aware that accessible journeys might require a need for a taxi, even if the distance is small. Stuart welcomed that feedback and expressed willingness to work with MACS and Transport Scotland policy officials in defining “accessibility” and developing a facility for planning accessible journey.

Action Point 11: Traveline to seek MACS and TS policy officials’ assistance in defining “accessibility” and will give MACS updates and where beneficial involve MACS on their work to develop a facility for planning accessible journey.

5.5.7 Hussein asked if disabled people are involved in the development and delivery of accessibility training for staff and Paul agreed to investigate the issue and report back to the committee.

Action Point 12: Paul White to report to MACS if disabled people are involved in the development and delivery of the accessibility training for bus and coach staff.

5.5.8 Joanne and Sheila confirmed that they had been working jointly on an exercise assessing buses accessibility and compatibility with surrounding infrastructure and offered to share that report with Paul and CPT members.

Action Point 13: Sheila and Joanne to share their report on buses accessibility and compatibility with surrounding infrastructure with CPT members.

5.5.9 Sheila suggested setting-up a subgroup to discuss in more depth the issues around buses accessibility and ensuring that disabled

people's needs are catered for. Paul expressed his willingness to join the group and facilitate contacts with operators.

Action Point 14: Sheila to set up a subgroup to discuss buses accessibility and invite CPT as a key stakeholder facilitating engagement with operators.

5.5.10 It was suggested that it would be beneficial to add to Traveline Scotland the links to the PAMIS database allowing allocation of the changing place toilets.

Action Point 15: Stuart to add to Traveline search engine a link to PAMIS changing places toilet database.

Agenda item 6a - Update from Hilary Stubbs on the Ferries and Aviation Workstream

6.1 As Hilary was not present, Linda provided a brief overview to the Committee on the content of the Ferries and Aviation update.

Agenda item 6b - Update from Sheila Fletcher on the Bus and Community Transport Workstream

6.2. Sheila had attended the most recent meeting of the Bus Stakeholder group and CPT had put forward a bid for the bus industry to be granted equivalent funding to the rail industry from the Government.

As there was a decline in the number of passengers using bus services, Sheila had encouraged providers and other bodies to contact the Department for Transport (DfT) to ask them to review the PSVAR regulations quicker than currently planned (2027).

6.3 Sheila confirmed that there have been a number of e-mails received into the MACS mailbox recently regarding the withdrawal of a bus route in Dundee. The information received suggests that the Council is providing an alternative, called the "Blether Bus". However this service is not available to general public as passengers have to become members and also have a concessionary card. The vehicle used on the service is not accessible and - as it is a minibus under 22 seats - does not have to comply with PSVAR.

Therefore usefulness of this scheme is rather limited as it its accessibility and scheduled stops. As MACS remit focuses on providing strategic advice to ministers and not dealing with individual complaints, Sheila

advised the correspondents that they should contact the Equality and Human Rights Commission (EHRC), as this falls within the remit of the Equality Act and has passed on these issues to the Bus Team at Transport Scotland. The meeting after the MACS Committee Meeting would provide Sheila with a further opportunity to discuss this with TS officials and cite them on the problems.

6.4 Sheila confirmed that she had recently attended a meeting between her local MP and Stagecoach at which the issue of buses being unable to line-up with the kerbs in Inverness bus station had been raised. This remains an issue, which is still to be addressed.

6.5 Sheila confirmed that there is also an issue in her local area with passengers from the nearby cruise liner terminal using public transport and this depleting the public transport available for local communities. She stated that due to the numbers of cruise liner visitors using local bus services, it is becoming increasingly difficult for local residents to use these services when a liner is visiting.

6.6 Sheila updated that due to some technical issues, the report being prepared by Sheila and Joanne on the different types of buses used by operators in Scotland has been delayed. It will be discussed at the next Committee meeting in October 2019.

6.7 Sheila agreed to circulate a note on the outcomes of her meeting with the Transport Scotland Bus Team which was taking place after the Committee meeting concluded.

<p>Action Point 16: Sheila Fletcher to circulate a note on the outcomes of her meeting with the TS Bus Team on 23rd July to the Committee.</p>
--

Agenda item 6c - Update from David Hunter on the Planning and Strategy Workstream

6.8 David Hunter updated the Committee on the most salient parts of his paper. He had attended a meeting with EHRC last month to discuss the launch of their Strategic Plan for 2019 to 2022. David circulated A5 flyers to Committee members, which detailed the Strategic Goals set-out in the Plan, especially with Marsali Craig sitting on EHRC's Scottish advisory committee.

He highlighted that Strategic Goal 1, Priority Aim 2, "Public Transport supports the economic and social inclusion of disabled people and older

people” presented MACS with a real opportunity to work with the EHRC to raise the level of awareness with all kinds of stakeholders.

6.9 David said that he would present an escalation paper at the next Committee meeting on specific opportunities for MACS to assist the EHRC in ensuring the implementation of the Equalities Act. He had already identified two potential opportunities; one related to the level of accessibility of documentation produced by Transport Focus, and the other was advising the EHRC to ensure that the National Transport Strategy (NTS) considers the requirements of disabled people.

He asked for any ideas and suggestions on other opportunities to work with EHRC to be sent to him for incorporation into the escalation paper.

Action Point 17: Committee members to consider ideas for future engagement between MACS and EHRC and send them to David Hunter as soon as possible.

6.10 David confirmed that he will be attending a meeting on the 13th August to discuss the Strategic Transport Project Review (STPR2). Following a discussion with one of the guest speakers at today’s meeting, David said that he intended to raise the lack of investment on bus stop infrastructure at this meeting.

He also intends to ask if there is an opportunity for Accessibility to become a strategic objective in this process.

6.11 Fraser asked if there was a timeframe for the completion of STPR and David replied that he had been told that mid-August was an opportune time to influence this process.

6.12 Sheila said that she had attended a meeting in Elgin and it seems that the consultation process is being run on a region by region but it was not clear when it would go out for full public consultation.

6.13 David said that his understanding is that STPR2 is a process rather than a document and it is still at the initial evidence gathering stage. He agreed to try to establish the current status of STPR2 and its next stages at the meeting in August.

Action Point 18: David Hunter to establish a current status of STPR2 and its next stages and the meeting in August.

6.14 Keith informed the Committee that he had spoken to Karen Armstrong to re-start the regular meetings between MACS and the EHRC. He will ask that David Hunter is invited to these meetings.

Agenda item 6d - Update from Hussein Patwa and Marsali Craig on the Rail Workstream

6.15 Hussein highlighted several key points contained in the latest Rail Workstream report:

6.15a The lack of accessible options at Stirling station whilst the footbridge was under repair has highlighted a need for better co-operation between Network Rail, Local Authorities and planners to minimise the impact on passengers.

6.15b Tactile paving is going to be incorporated into any platforms which are extended during the redevelopment work at Glasgow Queen Street station. There is some intelligence that some station staff do not feel that they are kept informed about changes to the station during the current on-going works and Hussein Patwa will pursue this via the Rail Forum.

6.16 David asked if there was any information available on the decision making process around the selection of stations that received funding to improve accessibility. Hussein explained that the DfT ask rail operators to submit nominations using criteria produced by the DfT. DfT assess the collated applications and then select which stations will receive funding and there is no quota for stations in Scotland. A copy of the spreadsheet containing the nominations used to be sent to the Rail workstream by the previous ScotRail Accessibility Manager, but this arrangement had ceased once MACS joined the stakeholders group.

6.17 David Hunter thanked Hussein for the update and asked if it is possible to obtain a copy of ScotRail's nominations against the DfT criteria. Hussein agreed to liaise with ScotRail and he will circulate the list to members via the Secretariat once he has obtained it.

<p>Action Point 19: Hussein Patwa to ask ScotRail for a list of the nominations which it made for the Access to All scheme and circulate this to the Committee.</p>
--

6.18 Hussein updated the meeting on information that he had gathered relating to how complaints made by disabled passengers are recorded. All complaints made to ScotRail go through the same channel and there

MINUTES

is no dedicated channel specifically for complaints made by disabled passengers, which is concerning.

6.19 Hussein has written to Transport Focus and has suggested that the use of a mystery shopper across all rail operators in Scotland might be useful to help address this gap. He is currently waiting on their response.

6.20 Sheila said that her daughter had recently travelled on the Inverness to Aberdeen line. Due to on-going works, she had been incorrectly advised that she had to give three days' notice to book passenger assistance to enable travel between Huntly and Dyce. She has raised this experience with Andrew Marshall-Roberts of ScotRail and hopefully this will be taken on board.

6.21 Hussein explained that ScotRail use a third party company called Journey Call to operate their passenger assistance line and ScotRail is only one of the train operators that use this company to operate its passenger assistance service.

6.22 Michael said that he has encountered a number of difficulties when using the ScotRail website and when trying to book Passenger Assistance online. Hussein replied that there was no update on this issue so far and he will ask Marsali to pursue this.

<p>Action Point 20: Hussein to ask Marsali to liaise with ScotRail Accessibility Manager to seek an update on the online facility to book Passenger Assist.</p>
--

6.23 Hussein confirmed that he is working with Go Upstream on its Making Connections event which takes place in Edinburgh on 30 July. The aim of the project is to enable disabled passengers to easily transition from one mode of transport to another. Linda has asked Karen Armstrong to obtain a copy of the success measures for this project for circulation to the committee.

<p>Action Point 21: Karen Armstrong to obtain a copy of the success measures for the "Making Connections" project and circulate this document to the Committee.</p>
--

6.24 Michael mentioned that during a previous meeting with Andrew Marshall-Roberts, he had raised the lack of a wheelchair space in first class carriages and the lack of any braille on buttons on the latest trains introduced by ScotRail. Andrew replied that ScotRail had met the

requirements of the contact and Hussein said that Marsali will follow this up with ScotRail.

Action Point 22: Marsali Craig to discuss with Andrew Marshall-Roberts the lack of wheelchair space in First Class carriages and no braille on buttons on the latest trains introduced into service.

Agenda item 6e - Update from Keith Robertson on the Roads, Infrastructure and Active Travel Workstream

6.25 Keith drew the Committee's attention to several key points contained in the Roads, Infrastructure and Active Travel workstream paper:

6.25a Wick is one of the winners of the Sustrans Design Assistance award and as a result all of the Pelican crossings in town will be upgraded to Puffin or Toucan crossings in the town. This was as a direct result of MACS involvement and partnership working with Sustrans Scotland.

6.25b Keith and Naghat Ahmed met with Karen Armstrong and Robert Wyllie of the Transport Scotland Accessibility Team to discuss improvements to the current Blue Badge arrangements. Keith asked if the Committee was in agreement for work on this to continue and there was unanimous agreement that this work should proceed.

6.25c Keith has been continuing to engage with the DfT on the re-writing of the existing guidance on Tactile Surfaces and he has been pushing for two Scottish cities to be included in any research on Inclusive Transport and Tactile Paving.

As a result of his activity, Edinburgh and Glasgow have been selected and he is looking for five volunteers to look at tactile surfaces in Edinburgh and Glasgow. The proposed dates for the exercise are the 7th, 12th and 19th August.

Keith asked if any Committee members would like to assist in this exercise and Michael Tornow has agreed to attend in Glasgow and Keith will cover the Edinburgh event.

6.26 Linda proposed that the local Access Panels should be able to assist with this and Keith said that he would liaise with Emma Scott in Disability Equality Scotland (DES).

6.27 Keith had attended a meeting of the Roads Authorities and Utilities Committee (Scotland) (RAUCS) to give a presentation. During the meeting, Keith raised the use of florescent colours on temporary ramps and other adaptations at roadworks, and he was advised that this was the remit of the Health and Safety Executive (HSE). Despite repeated attempts by both Douglas and himself, HSE have refused to meet to discuss this topic and Keith will put this work on hold for the moment.

6.28 Keith and Naghat met with the Transport Scotland Low Emission Vehicles (LEV) team and Keith intends to ask this team to facilitate a site visit to a charging point. There is no single defined design for charging points and this needs to be resolved.

Keith asked the MACS Secretariat to arrange a site visit on his behalf.

Action Point 23: MACS Secretariat to engage with TS LEV team to facilitate a site visit to a recently installed LEV charging point for Keith Robertson and Naghat Ahmed.

6.29 MACS has been asked to submit written evidence by the Rural Economy and Connectivity Committee (REC) of the Scottish Parliament for its pre-budget scrutiny on road maintenance and road works.

Keith will send in a submission from an accessibility perspective and he asked the Committee for its views on whether he should ask for MACS to be given an opportunity to provide verbal evidence to the REC.

The Committee agreed with Keith's suggestion and asked the MACS Secretariat to write to Convener of the REC to ask if MACS can give verbal evidence.

Action Point 24: MACS Secretariat to contact the REC Convener, Edward Mountain, and ask if there is an opportunity for MACS to give verbal evidence.

Agenda Item 7 – Any Other Business (AOB)

7.1 Keith asked the MACS Secretariat if there was a specific reason why members received the Inclusion Scotland newsletter and not any others. Aga Lysak replied that it is likely that MACS have been added to the distribution list for Inclusion Scotland publications at some point and this is why the newsletters are sent to MACS. Keith asked if the MACS Secretariat can arrange for MACS to be added to the distribution lists for

the Glasgow Disability Alliance (GDA) and Disability Equality Scotland (DES).

Action Point 25: MACS Secretariat to arrange for the MACS e-mail address to be added to the distribution list for the Glasgow Disability Alliance (GDA) and Disability Equality Scotland (DES).

7.2 Fraser advised that he will circulate to members his report on the parking working group meeting.

Action Point 26: Fraser to circulate to members his report from the parking working group meeting.

7.3 Linda advised the Committee that Susan Fulton has been appointed as the MACS representative on the Sustrans Inclusive Infrastructure Steering Group. Susan will feed in contributions relating to this group into future reports for the Roads, Infrastructure and Active Travel Workstream.

Action points for the meeting held on 23 July 2019

No.	Ref	Action	Update
1	2.2	Karen Armstrong to work with TS Steering Group on defining the terminology of “accessibility” and how this term should be interpreted.	
2	2.4b	Hussein Patwa to provide an update on which Scottish stations can benefit from Access for All funding.	
3	3.6.9	David to contact Audit Scotland and request that they conduct a further audit on Transport for Health and Social Care as a follow up to the last report produced in 2011.	
4	3.6.11	Aga to invite Sam Richie, Head of Patient Transport Service at Scottish Ambulance Service (SAS) to the MACS October meeting.	
5	3.7	MACS to request a meeting with Ms McKelvie, the Minister for Older People and Equalities.	
6	4.5.1	Karen Armstrong to obtain and share with MACS the Go Upstream survey result.	
7	4.5.2	Secretariat to contact the TS Rail Team and find out what and who Equality Advisory Panels are.	
8	4.5.3	Planning ad Strategy Workstream to review the Accessible Travel Annual Delivery Plan 2019/2020 between December 2019 and February 2020.	
9	5.4	Paul White to forward CPT’s members’ feedback on MACS Annual Report.	
10	5.5.5	Paul White to ensure that CPT members are aware of the need to comply with Equality Act 2010.	
11	5.5.6	Traveline to seek MACS and TS policy officials’ assistance in defining “accessibility” and will give MACS updates and where beneficial involve MACS on their work to develop a facility for planning accessible journey.	
12	5.5.7	Paul White to report to MACS if disabled people are involved in the development and delivery of the accessibility training for bus and coach staff.	Completed. Email sent on 25/07/2019
13	5.5.8	Sheila and Joanne to share their report on buses accessibility and compatibility with surrounding infrastructure with CPT members.	

MINUTES

14	5.5.9	MACS to set up a subgroup to discuss buses accessibility and invite CPT as a key stakeholder facilitating engagement with operators.	
15	5.5.10	Stuart to add to Traveline search engine a link to PAMIS changing places toilet database.	
16	6.7	Sheila Fletcher to circulate a note on the outcomes of her meeting with the TS Bus Team on 23 rd July to the Committee.	
17	6.9	Committee members to consider ideas for future engagement between MACS and EHRC and send them to David Hunter as soon as possible.	
18	6.13	David Hunter to establish a current status of STPR2 and its next stages and the meeting in August.	
19	6.17	Hussein Patwa to ask ScotRail for a list of the nominations which it made for the Access to All scheme and circulate this to the Committee.	
20	6.22	Hussein to ask Marsali to liaise with ScotRail Accessibility Manager to seek an update on the online facility to book Passenger Assist.	
21	6.23	Karen Armstrong to obtain a copy of the success measures for the “Making Connections” project and circulate this document to the Committee.	
22	6.24	Marsali Craig to discuss with Andrew Marshall-Roberts the lack of wheelchair space in First Class carriages and no braille on buttons on the latest trains introduced into service.	
23	6.28	MACS Secretariat to engage with TS LEV team to facilitate a site visit to a recently installed LEV charging point for Keith Robertson and Naghat Ahmed.	
24	6.29	MACS Secretariat to contact the REC Convener, Edward Mountain, and ask if there is an opportunity for MACS to give verbal evidence.	
25	7.1	MACS Secretariat to arrange for the MACS e-mail address to be added to the distribution list for the Glasgow Disability Alliance (GDA) and Disability Equality Scotland (DES).	
26	7.2	Fraser to circulate to members his report from the parking working group meeting.	